CITY OF VAUGHAN

REPORT NO. 9 OF THE

HERITAGE VAUGHAN COMMITTEE

For consideration by the Committee of the Whole of the City of Vaughan on January 17, 2012

The Heritage Vaughan Committee met at 7:10 p.m., on November 16, 2011.

Present:	John Mifsud, Chair Roger Dickinson Richard Hahn Councillor Marilyn Iafrate Nick Pacione Fadia Pahlawan Christine Radewych Regional Councillor Deb Schulte Rajbir Singh Claudio Travierso
Also Present:	Angela Palermo, Manager of Cultural Services Lauren Archer, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator Cecilia Nin Hernandez, Cultural Heritage Co-ordinator

The following items were dealt with:

1 PRESENTATION BY TRCA DELEGATION: FINDINGS OF THE HUMBER RIVER BRIDGE INVENTORY

Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That the presentation by the Ms. Heather Grey Broadbent and Ms. Susan Robertson, TRCA, 5 Shoreham Drive, Downsview, M3N 1S4, and publication titled "Crossing the Humber: The Humber River Heritage Bridge Inventory", be received;
- 2) That the following recommendation be deferred:

AND FURTHER THAT Heritage Vaughan work towards the implementation of the recommendations contained within Crossing The Humber: The Humber River Heritage Bridge Inventory as it relates to heritage bridges within the City of Vaughan.

3) That the report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be received.

Recommendation

 That Heritage Vaughan receive the presentation by the TRCA delegation on the findings of the Humber River Bridge Inventory and approve the following recommendation, as provided by the TRCA:

- i. THAT Heritage Vaughan recognizes the significance of Crossing The Humber: The Humber River Heritage Bridge Inventory to the Humber River Watershed's Canadian Heritage River System designation;
- ii. THAT Heritage Vaughan adopt Crossing The Humber: The Humber River Heritage Bridge Inventory;
- iii. AND FURTHER THAT Heritage Vaughan work towards the implementation of the recommendations contained within Crossing The Humber: The Humber River Heritage Bridge Inventory as it relates to heritage bridges within the City of Vaughan.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To receive the information presented by the TRCA delegation.

Background - Analysis and Options

1.0 Analysis - Current Proposal by Applicant:

Information to be provided by the delegation at the meeting. Please see attached documents for preliminary information.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL: Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES: Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Please refer to recommendations.

Attachment: Resolution

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

2 695 NASHVILLE ROAD, HERITAGE REVIEW APPLICATION FOR A REVISED HERITAGE PERMIT FOR PROPERTY WITHIN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE HERITAGE <u>CONSERVATION DISTRICT</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That this matter was reconsidered;
- 2) That this matter was deferred to Legal Services for an opinion on this offence under the Ontario Heritage Act;
- 3) That the report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be received; and
- 4) That the deputation of Mr. Andrew DiLorenzo, 68 Millwick Drive, Suite 16, Toronto, M9L 1Y3, be received.

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee consider the subject application for a revised heritage permit to include the as-built arched window.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to

relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the as-built condition of the subject second storey addition to the existing building at 695 Nashville Rd. and consider an amended Heritage Permit to reflect changes made to the design during the construction of the addition by the applicant.

Background - Analysis and Options

1.0 Background

- 1.1 The subject property is located within the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District and is, therefore, designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 1.2 All proposed changes to the property (including exterior alterations, additions or demolition) require, in addition to all other City approvals, the approval of a Heritage Permit application in accordance with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- 1.3 The subject building was constructed in the 1960s in the Ranch Bungalow architectural style, which is considered a Non-heritage architectural style in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.
- 1.4 The Heritage Vaughan Committee first reviewed the plans and elevation drawings for a Heritage Permit Application for the proposed addition and renovation of the subject property at their August 21, 2006 meeting.

2.0 Analysis

- 2.1 The applicant originally proposed to replace the single-storey garage on the west side of the house with a two-storey addition with a front gable roof.
- 2.2 Cultural Services staff worked with the applicant to ensure that the proposal is sympathetic to the heritage character of the property and streetscape and that it is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines.
- 2.3 The Heritage Vaughan Committee approved the elevations, as they appear in the Attachments Section of the following report at the August 21, 2006 meeting of Heritage Vaughan.
- 2.4 The applicant did not build as per the drawings approved, instead, the applicant build an arched window in the front gable of the second storey addition.
- 2.5 This discrepancy was documented by Cultural Services staff, and in May 16, 2007 the Heritage Vaughan Committee made the following recommendation:

Heritage Vaughan recommends:

That, Heritage Vaughan <u>not</u> approve the owner's proposal to approve a revision to Heritage Permit 2006-018 that would allow an arched front window on the house at 695 Nashville Road, and;

That, Heritage Vaughan direct the owner to devise a plan to return the front façade and window design to a state that is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines which then may be approved by Cultural Services staff as a revised version of Heritage Permit 2006-018.

- 2.6 Cultural Services staff had discussed with the applicant at the time the arched window was discussed, as well as the importance of remaining sympathetic to the original heritage character of the property and streetscape and maintain a design which is in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Design Guidelines.
- 2.7 The applicant was made aware that the use of an arched window is not in keeping with the original heritage character of a 1960s Ranch Bungalow style home during the pre-consultation process, and was aware that this style of window was not considered in keeping with the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District guidelines.
- 2.8 The applicant did not do as recommended. As such, the window remains as built. The applicant received notice from the Building Standards department that the addition was not completed as proposed.
- 2.9 The applicant argues that there are several similar arched windows visible on Nashville Road, and that windows of this style are typical within the district.
- 2.10 The subject Building Permit application is considered Open, and has not been closed by the Building department for reasons that include this discrepancy between the submitted drawings and the as-built condition.
- 2.11 No order to comply has been issued by the Building department to the applicant to date.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL: Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

• STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

The subject applicant has already requested an amendment to the subject application, which was reviewed with the proposed addition was still under construction, and the applicant was informed that the window was not appropriate on several occasions. Considering the history of the subject application, is apparent that the applicant has chosen to disregard the recommendations made by Cultural Services staff and by the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

3 197 WOODBRIDGE AVE. DOCTORS MCLEAN CARRIAGE HOUSE, REQUEST FOR DEMOLITION OF BUILDING WITHIN THE WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION <u>DISTRICT</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That Heritage Vaughan does not approve the demolition and requests that the applicant restore the property;
- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be received; and
- 3) That the following deputations be received:
 - 1. Mr. Nino Rico, 10 -201 Spinnaker Way, Concord, L4K 4C6; and
 - 2. Mr. Don Cooper, 75 Westmore Drive, Toronto, M9V 3Y6.

Recommendation

1. That Heritage Vaughan consider the request for demolition of Doctors McLean Carriage House located at 197 Woodbridge Ave.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

<u>Purpose</u>

To review the documentation provided for the Carriage House structure located at 197 Woodbridge Ave. and consider the information provided by the owner and the demolition of the subject structure.

Background - Analysis and Options

- 1.0 Heritage Status
 - 1.1 The subject property at located at 197 Woodbridge Avenue is designated part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, as it is part of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District.
 - 1.2 The property is identified as a Contributing building in the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Inventory.
 - 1.3 The subject property is also listed in the City's *Register of Buildings of Architectural and Historical Value*.
 - 1.4 The subject structure is a Victorian Carriage House style, built circa 1893, by Dr. Peter Douglas McLean in 1893, a local doctor and elected Member of Parliament in 1907. Two generations of McLean doctors served the community after their father -Dr. Garnet Douglas and Dr. Charles McLean.
 - 1.5 Doctors McLean District Park in Woodbridge was named in honour of their service to the community.
 - 1.6 Peter McLean owned the first automobile. In Woodbridge and in 1910 the structure was converted for use as an automobile garage.
 - 1.7 Summary of architectural character defining elements:
 - 1.7.1 rough timber post and beam structure, as confirmed in the Engineer's letter.
 - 1.7.2 East elevation: Gabled roof with one central gothic gable with rectangular masonry opening for wood louvered vent.
 - 1.7.3 two door urban barn/garage at gable end. Depressed elliptical arch of front left door bricked in when wood lintels installed for two (single) swinging garage doors for automobile c. 1910.
 - 1.7.4 painted rough sawn lintels on north elevation
 - 1.7.5 swing door (vertical paneling) on west side
 - 1.7.6 Gothic central gable
 - 1.7.7 Window openings with wood louvered shutters
 - 1.7.8 Rectangular Window opening
 - 1.7.9 clad in red brick with segmental and depressed elliptical brick arches 1893)
 - 1.7.10 wood vertical board hinged hay loft access doors on north elevation and on west elevation.

2.0 Current Proposal

The current owner of the property has requested the demolition of the structure and has submitted a letter from an engineer recommending the demolition of the structure (attached in this report).

The Building Standards Department has deemed the building unsafe for occupancy and has requested the owner to secure the building until such time as Heritage Vaughan reviews its demolition.

3.0 Analysis

The engineer's letter explains the structure's poor condition. The issues identified in the letter include the shifting of the foundation on the east side and resulting danger of buckling of the east foundation wall and the brick veneer above it. Other related damage is described in the letter which is attached to this report. It states that to remedy the issues, reconstruction of the foundation and timber structure as well as the east and west wall's brick veneer will be necessary. The letter concludes that considering the type of building, it would not constitute a cost effective approach to remedy the issues found and it recommends the demolition of the structure.

With permission of the owner staff visited the site to document the exterior. The structure was photographed from the outside, and the issues described in the letter can be observed. Cultural Services can provide a visual confirmation of evidence of possible issues affecting a structure to be noted for evaluation by a licensed structural engineer; however staff does not provide structural integrity evaluations of buildings as this falls outside of staff's scope. Please see photos attached.

The City's Building inspector has deemed the building unsafe due to its condition and requested the owner ensure it is secure so that no can gain entry. The inspector feels that it is unstable enough to be of danger to neighbouring buildings and should anyone enter it.

Cultural Services also obtained historical information on the structure; please refer to section 1.0 of this report. A full Built Heritage Evaluation was not possible due to lack of access to the interior of the structure due to its condition. It has architectural value in it being the only urban barn/garage type building of its architectural, construction type and vintage in our City's Inventory and has an historical association with its original owner. Please refer to Character Defining elements noted above. However, the building is in poor condition.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL: Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES: Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

The subject heritage building is identified as having significant architectural and historical value, and is also significant its contribution to the heritage character of the Woodbridge Ave. streetscape and building stock. The demolition of contributing buildings within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District is not recommended. Retention, preservation and restoration of the subject Carriage House is recommended.

However, the subject structure has also been identified as being in poor structural condition and that correcting the issues would be monetarily costly.

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator Recreation and Culture Department

Cecilia Nin Hernandez Cultural Heritage Coordinator Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

4 9593 KEELE STREET, MAPLE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT, HERITAGE REVIEW APPLICATION FOR REAR ADDITION AND SECOND STOREY FRONT ADDITION TO <u>EXISTING BUILDING</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

That the recommendation of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, was approved.

Recommendation

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan approve the proposed work and proposed additions to the existing home at 9696 Keele Street as depicted in the attached drawings and as described in the Analysis portion of this report.
- 2. That the applicant provide two full sets of final drawings, including site plan and all elevations for Cultural Services staff for final approval, and;
- 3. That the applicant provides samples of exterior building materials and paint samples for consideration and approval by Cultural Services staff at a time when this information is known to the applicant.
- 4. Should any changes occur to the proposal as submitted, the applicant is required to contact Cultural Services in order to consult and obtain approval of a revised Heritage Permit.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, and Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the Heritage Review application for 9696 Keele Street to renovate the existing and add a second storey to the existing house.

Background - Analysis and Options

The applicant has requested that Heritage Vaughan review the following proposed work to the property at 9696 Keele Street:

2.0 Heritage Status

2.1 The subject property at 9593 Keele Street is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act as a part of the Maple Heritage Conservation District.

3.0 Brief History of the Site:

- 3.1 Built circa 2000, hipped roof Neo-Georgian architectural style, not considered a heritage architectural style under the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan.
- 3.2 It is not of a heritage style as identified within the Maple Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines.
- 3.3 In September 2011, the applicant contacted Cultural Services after applying for a Building Permit for the proposed changes. The applicant initially proposed the rear addition only.
- 3.4 A one storey front elevation addition has been approved previous to the Maple Heritage Conservation District coming into effect.
- 3.5 After consultation with the applicant, the property owner decided to also include a second storey addition to the front elevation in addition to the rear addition.

4.0 Analysis - Current Proposal by Applicant:

- 4.1 The applicant proposes the following work following Section 9.4.1.1 Contemporary Alteration Approach:
 - 4.1.1 Two storey addition to the rear of the structure:
 - o is subordinate to the existing structure,
 - o will not be visible from the street,
 - o is of a style in keeping with the existing non-heritage style of the building.

- 4.1.2 Two storey addition to the front of the structure:
- Will replace an existing porch on the front elevation.
- The subject two storey addition will not exceed the height of the existing roofline,
- o Is in keeping with the architectural style of the existing structure.
- All materials are to match the existing, and be in accordance with the HCD Guidelines. Samples to be submitted for approval.
- 4.2 The Maple HCDG provides two approach options for the renovations of non-heritage structures within the Heritage Conservation District Guidelines, Historical Conversion and Contemporary Alteration:
 - The proposed additions take the approach outlined in Section 9.4.1.1 Contemporary Alteration Approach, which would allow the existing style to be continued in the new work.
 - "Additions and alterations using the Contemporary Alteration approach should respect, and be consistent with, the original design of the building."
 - The proposed additions are in keeping with the character of the existing house, and would be considered compatible Contemporary Alteration.
 - As such, Cultural Services has no concerns with the proposed additions.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Overall, the proposed work is in keeping with the Maple Heritage Conservation District Guidelines in design and materials, the heritage character of the subject building, and ensures the continuous, meaningful use of the subject property.

Considering the information on the attached drawings, staff recommends approval of the design.

All exterior materials are subject to the Heritage Conservation District Guidelines and approval. Staff recommends that all material samples be submitted when available for staff review and approval. (A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

5 8204 KIPLING AVE. HERITAGE REVIEW APPLICATION FOR PROPOSED NEW DEVELOPMENT WITHIN THE WOODBRIDGE HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be approved; and
- 2) That the applicant and staff work to:
 - 1. implement a conservation plan t the existing house;
 - 2. revise the south elevation of the Kipling house block;
 - 3. use darkest exterior brick colour for adjacent townhouse block to match existing home;
 - 4. create a variance in colour, texture window and roof treatments along the Kipling elevations.

Recommendation

- 1. That Heritage Vaughan have no objections to the subject development, with the following conditions of final approval for a future Heritage Permit application:
 - a) That the proposed contemporary design conform to the surrounding character area by amending the design to include all of the requested changes as outlined in Sections 3.4 and 3.5 of this report.
- 2. That the applicant and staff work together to resolve the above-referenced issues.
- 3. That should any additional changes occur to the proposed, the applicant provide a full set of final drawings, including site plan and all elevations for final approval by Cultural Services staff and/or Heritage Vaughan, and;
- 4. That the applicant provide samples of building materials and paint samples for consideration and approval by Cultural Services staff at a time when this information is known to the applicant.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

N/A

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the documentation provided for the property at 8204 Kipling Ave, to determine whether the proposed design is in keeping with the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

Background - Analysis and Options

4.0 Heritage Status

- 4.1 The subject property at 8204 Kipling Ave is located within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District. Proposed changes to properties designated within heritage conservation districts must be in keeping with the heritage character of the building, the historical streetscape and must be in conformance with the heritage district plan and design guidelines.
- 4.2 The subject property also includes the Moody Darker House, a Victorian Vernacular building, constructed circa 1885, which is identified as a Contributing building within the Woodbridge HCD. The subject building is currently used as a sales office, and was renovated to suit this use before the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District came into effect. No further alterations are proposed for the subject building.

5.0 Application Background

- 5.1 In June 2008, Council approved a site development application for the subject lands, with conditions. The Site Plan application was not subject to Heritage Vaughan review at this time, as the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District had not yet been adopted.
- 5.2 Since the Site Plan approval, the property has changed hands several times, the new owners have submitted a plan for Phase One that appears to be consistent with the built form approved by Council, to be confirmed by the Development Planning Department.
- 5.3 The applicant has been working with various City Departments, including Cultural Services. The subject proposed design has been significantly amended to be more in keeping with the Heritage Character of Kipling Ave.
- 5.4 On August 22, 2011 the applicant submitted a revised plan consisting of two phases. This application does not constitute a new Site Plan Application, but rather is being assessed as a Site Plan Amendment.
- 5.5 Phase One includes 34, 3 storey Live Work units, and existing heritage house and 222 parking spaces and is currently proposed for review by the Heritage Vaughan Committee.
- 5.6 The subject building height, number of storeys and units has been approved by the Committee of Adjustment and in the Zoning By-Law for the site.

5.7 Phase 2 has been identified as future development, and will require the review and approval of a Heritage Permit.

6.0 Current Proposal

- 6.1 The property owner, LTC Investment Group Ltd., has submitted elevations for 18 blocks consisting of 34, 3 storey Live Work units for Heritage Review.
- 6.2 The subject building draws from local Victorian Vernacular and Edwardian design elements, but presents them in a contemporary context. In new buildings within the district Architectural detailing should refer to the nature, immediate context and the attributes of the Character Area in which it is to be placed. (See Appendix I for applicant design rationale.)
- 6.3 The applicant has made the following changes in response to Cultural Services comments:
 - 6.3.1 Eliminated lower level basement windows on the front elevation to deemphasize the height of the subject building.
 - 6.3.2 Reduced the height of walk-up stairs on front elevation.
 - 6.3.3 Introduced design variations from block to block including: Brick colour, material distribution, dormer and gable design, entranceway and window variation.
 - 6.3.4 Entranceways have been emphasized as a key feature of residential character. Doors have been altered to be more reflective of residential character.
 - 6.3.5 Windows have been significantly altered during the consultation process to be more in keeping with the character of the Woodbridge HCD.
 - 6.3.6 Design features, materials, architectural elements have been used throughout the proposed development, not just on front elevations.
- 6.4 The applicant has not addressed the following outstanding comments:
 - 6.4.1 The roof as proposed does not reflect the roof style or pitch of any historic precedent. Parapet rooflines, mansard roofs, and complex roof types are not typical of the heritage character of Woodbridge.

Roof pitch has been amended to be less shallow in response to Cultural Services comments, however, the historic precedent used is still unclear. The applicant has provided an example of a similar mansard found within the Woodbridge HCD (See Appendix I). The identified building is not considered a Contributing building.

Cultural Services recommends the proposed development utilize a roof pitch with historic precedent within the district.

6.4.2 The material distribution of stone and brick on the front and side elevations is not typical of any historic precedent found within the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District, notably, in the use of stone Cultural Services recommends the proposed stone be reduced to the foundation level.

- 6.5 Architectural design elements from latest drawings:
 - 6.5.1 Cultural Services recommends that the porthole windows be removed or amended to reflect a more appropriate historical precedent.
 - 6.5.2 Gable features found on side elevations have been amended to reflect an Edwardian style of gable. The previous open gable type is more appropriate.

Cultural Services recommends that the previous gable style be used.

- 6.5.3 Classical pediment-type dormers found on front elevations are recommended to revert back to previously submitted gable design, or, alternatively, be amended to be shallower pitch, to a scale more reflective of historic precedents.
- 6.5.4 All proposed arched windows are to match window openings, as seen in the proposed renderings. Squared window-types within arched window openings are not appropriate.
- 6.6 Landscaping and Streetscape Design:
 - 6.6.1 New development is required to be pedestrian oriented, and create pedestrian friendly spaces and walkways. The subject development is required to contribute to the quality and connectivity of the pedestrian environment.
 - 6.6.2 The proposed development landscape has been amended to facilitate and encourage pedestrian traffic from Kipling Ave. to the centre of the site as per Section 6.6.2 of the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District Guidelines – Pedestrian Circulation encourages the accommodation within and without new developments to give pedestrian movement priority over the accommodation of vehicles.
 - 6.6.3 The proposed development is encouraged to incorporate additional interlock paving to support pedestrian movement within the site, and link the sidewalks along Kipling Ave. to the centre of the development.
 - 6.6.4 As depicted in the proposed drawings, the new development provides a small landscaped area, which could reflect a front yard that faces Kipling Ave., as outlined in the Woodbridge HCD Guidelines. Soft landscaping, grass and/or permeable paving units, such as interlock pavers, is recommended.
 - 6.6.5 The proposed development is required to provide an enhanced streetscape with an enhanced urban tree canopy. The subject application proposes planting street trees in pockets along the front façade, with some soft landscaping.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

- STRATEGIC GOAL: Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.
- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES: Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council, and the necessary resources to implement this program have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

N/A

Conclusion

Overall, the proposed application does generally conform to the Woodbridge Heritage Conservation District guidelines, and intends to reflect the existing heritage streetscape and character area.

Cultural Services has identified the following design elements to be revised prior to any final approval of a future Heritage Permit application:

- Cultural Services recommends the proposed development utilize a roof pitch and style with historic precedent within the district.
- Cultural Services recommends the proposed stone cladding be reduced to the foundation level.
- Cultural Services recommends that the porthole windows be removed or amended to reflect a more appropriate historical precedent.
- Cultural Services recommends that the previous gable style be used. Gable features found on side elevations have been amended to reflect an Edwardian style of gable. The previous open gable type is more appropriate.
- Cultural Services recommends that the Classical pediment-type dormers found on front elevations revert back to previously submitted gable design, or, alternatively, be amended to be shallower pitch, to a scale more reflective of historic precedents.
- All proposed arched windows are to match window openings, as seen in the proposed renderings. Squared window-types within arched window openings are not appropriate.

The buildings to the rear of the development are to conform to the design of the front buildings and should not be drastically different stylistically from the final design of the front buildings.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

6 12 CENTRE STREET, HERITAGE REVIEW OF PROPOSED GROUND SIGN WITHIN <u>THE THORNHILL HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

That the recommendation of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, was approved in the omnibus motion under the adoption of items not requiring separate discussion.

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee approve the proposed signage for the Thornhill Naturopathic Health Clinic.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the submitted proposed signage for the Thornhill Naturopathic Health Clinic, within the Thornhill heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

- 1.0 Heritage Status
 - 1.1 The subject property at 12 Centre Street is designated Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act as a part of the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District.
 - 1.2 The subject building at 12 Centre Street is considered a heritage building as described in the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

2.0 Analysis

2.1 The City of Vaughan Sign By-Law 203-92 regulates signage in the City. All Heritage Conservation Districts within the City of Vaughan are identified as Special Sign Districts under Section 11 of the Sign By-law and must also conform to the applicable Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.

- 2.2 The subject sign is in keeping with The City of Vaughan Sign By-Law 203-92, Section 11 and does not require a Sign Variance application.
- 2.3 The subject signage is of an appropriate height and material, and utilizes historically sympathetic design, colours and text.
- 2.4 The proposed location will not obscure any significant architectural feature of 12 Centre St.
- 2.5 As such, Cultural Services staff have no concerns regarding the proposed signage, and recommends that the signage be approved.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

- STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:
- Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

The proposed signage is in keeping with both the Thornhill Heritage Conservation District Guidelines and Section 11 of the City of Vaughan Sign By-Law. Cultural Services has no concerns with the subject signage and as such recommends that the signage be approved.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

7 180 NASHVILLE ROAD, CORNERSTONE COMMUNITY CHURCH, HERITAGE REVIEW OF PROPOSED GROUND SIGN WITHIN THE KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE <u>HERITAGE CONSERVATION DISTRICT</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That the recommendation contained in the following report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be approved; and
- 2) That the deputation of Mr. James Lewis, 126 Dawlish Avenue, Aurora, L4G 6R3, be

received.

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee refuse the proposed electronic message board ground signage proposed for 180 Nashville Road in the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To review the submitted proposed signage for the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

Background - Analysis and Options

- 3.0 Heritage Status
 - 3.1 The subject property at 180 Nashville Road is designated Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act as a part of the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District.

4.0 Analysis

- 4.1 The City of Vaughan Sign By-Law 203-92 regulates signage in the City. All Heritage Conservation Districts within the City of Vaughan are identified as Special Sign Districts under Section 11 of the Sign By-law and must also conform to the applicable Heritage Conservation District Guidelines.
- 4.2 The subject sign is in contravention of the The City of Vaughan Sign By-Law 203-92, Section 11 and it does require a Sign Variance application.
- 4.3 The subject signage is of an appropriate height and material, and utilizes historically sympathetic design, colours, however the electronic message area is not permitted in the District and approval of this signage would set a negative precedent for other requests of this nature. Staff therefore, cannot recommend approval of this sign.

4.4 The proposed location will not obscure any significant architectural feature of 180 Nashville Road

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

• STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

The proposed signage is not in keeping with both the Kleinburg-Nashville Heritage Conservation District Guidelines and Section 11 of the City of Vaughan Sign By-Law.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

8 HERITAGE PRESERVATION AWARDS, CALL FOR NOMINATIONS

Heritage Vaughan advises:

- 1) That the following be nominated to receive Heritage Preservation Awards:
 - Starbuck's, Kleinburg
 - 82 Monsheen
 - Property on Keele Street at Rutherford
- 2) That the report of Cultural Services, dated November 16, 2011, be received.

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee nominate local heritage individuals and organizations that have made an outstanding contribution to the preservation of heritage and cultural resources in the City of Vaughan.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

Purpose

To nominate individuals and/or organizations for the 2011 Vaughan Preservation Awards.

Background - Analysis and Options

Heritage Week is celebrated throughout the Province of Ontario every year during the third week of February and provides an opportunity to commemorate the history of communities, its buildings and landmarks, and the people who have contributed to its unique heritage and culture. To celebrate Heritage Week, Heritage Vaughan Committee hosts an event in conjunction with Vaughan Council to recognize individuals for their efforts in the area of heritage conservation in the City of Vaughan.

Council adopted the Vaughan Heritage Preservation Awards program in 1989 to recognize individuals and organizations that have made an outstanding contribution to the preservation of heritage and cultural resources in the City of Vaughan.

Cultural Services staff requests that the Heritage Vaughan Committee propose nominees that have made an outstanding contribution to the preservation of heritage and cultural resources in the City of Vaughan.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

• STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

Cultural Services staff requests that the Heritage Vaughan Committee consider heritage projects completed recently in the City of Vaughan and encourages committee members to nominate any individual or group that they feel has done exceptional work in the area of heritage conservation in the City of Vaughan.

Attachments

None

Report prepared by:

Lauren Archer Cultural Heritage Coordinator Recreation and Culture Department

Angela Palermo Manager of Cultural Services Recreation and Culture Department

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

9 ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT CONTRAVENTION FINES AND HERITAGE VAUGHAN <u>COMMITTEE MANDATE DISCUSSION</u>

Heritage Vaughan advises:

That this matter be deferred to a future meeting.

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Vaughan Committee receive the following information regarding Ontario Heritage Act contravention fines and the role of the Heritage Vaughan Committee.

Contribution to Sustainability

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council in the Green Directions, Vaughan, Community Sustainability Environmental Master Plan, Goal 4, Objective 4.1:

• To foster a city with strong social cohesion, an engaging arts scene, and a clear sense of its culture and heritage.

Economic Impact

None

Communications Plan

All agenda items and minutes relating to Heritage Vaughan committee meetings are circulated to relevant City departments, applicants and their representatives.

<u>Purpose</u>

To receive the following information regarding Ontario Heritage Act contravention fines and the role of the Heritage Vaughan Committee as requested by the committee in October 2011.

Background - Analysis and Options

The Role of Municipal Heritage Committees:

The Ontario Heritage Act defines the statutory role of municipal heritage committees, but also states that other responsibilities may be assigned to these committees through by-laws passed by the municipal council. The establishment of a municipal heritage committee enables a municipality to encourage community participation in local heritage conservation. In practice, a heritage committee often has a dual responsibility:

- <u>To the municipality</u> to advise council on heritage issues (under the *Ontario Heritage Act);* and, to carry out assigned duties according to the municipal by-law or resolution and procedures established by the municipality; and
- <u>To the citizens of the municipality</u> to help ensure that plans for change and progress be developed in a manner which recognizes the historical continuity of their community.

On May 2, 1977, Council established Heritage Vaughan with the enactment of By-law No.86-77 pursuant to Section 28 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The Committee's statutory role is advisory to Council and is recognized as the legitimate vehicle for coordinating and conveying community concerns respecting heritage conservation activities.

Responsibilities of Heritage Vaughan

Heritage Vaughan's activities flow from its statutory authority and are part of its advisory functions. Heritage Vaughan is given by Council the following duties:

Heritage Vaughan provides guidance and advice to Council in making decisions on any matters relating to the designation and conservation of property of cultural heritage value or interest, as individual properties or as heritage conservation districts pursuant to the Ontario Heritage Act (s.28) as follows:

- To advise and assist the Council on all matters relating to the designation of individual properties (Part IV) or heritage conservation districts (Part V);
- Applications to alter, demolish or remove designated properties;
- Applications to repeal by-laws which designate individual properties as heritage properties;
- Recommendations to enter into heritage conservation easement agreements or covenants; and
- To advise and assist the Council on other heritage matters as Council may deem appropriate by by-law.

Heritage Vaughan also has the responsibility to keep Council informed of its plans and activities. This is often accomplished through committee minutes and reports, and by having members of Council appointed to the committee as the first line of communication. Another method of ensuring council's awareness on heritage conservation issues is through monthly reporting through the Heritage Vaughan Minutes, which are approved by the Committee of the Whole every month.

Ontario Heritage Act Fines

Section 69 of the Act allows for imposition of a fine of up to \$1 million for any person found illegally demolishing a property in a Heritage Conservation District. This amount recognizes that illegal demolition of designated heritage properties is one of the most serious offences under the Act. Provision is also made for municipalities to recover the costs of restoring illegally altered buildings or structures designated under Part IV or Part V.

Since the Ontario Heritage Act was passed in 1974, there have been only a small number of prosecutions carried out by municipalities for contravention of the provisions of the Act, mainly for unauthorized alterations or demolition of designated property.

Please see the Attachments section for extracts from the Ontario Heritage Act and the Heritage Vaughan By-Law.

Relationship to Vaughan Vision 2020/Strategic Plan

Reference specific initiative report relates to:

In consideration of the strategic priorities related to Vaughan Vision 2020, the report will provide:

• STRATEGIC GOAL:

Service Excellence - Providing service excellence to citizens.

• STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

Preserve our heritage and support diversity, arts and culture.

This report is consistent with the priorities previously set by Council and the necessary resources have been allocated and approved.

Regional Implications

None

Conclusion

Cultural Services staff will discuss the following items at the November 16th 2011, Heritage Vaughan meeting.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

10

11

2012 MEETING DATES

Heritage Vaughan advises:

That the 2012 meeting dates be approved.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing have been forwarded to each Member of Council and a copy thereof is also on file in the office of the City Clerk.)

NEW BUSINESS – HERITAGE DESIGNATION SIGNS

Heritage Vaughan advises:

That staff be requested to provide information on the recently erected signs identifying the City's Heritage Districts.

The meeting adjourned at 11:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

John Mifsud, Chair

Report Prepared by: Rose Magnifico, Assistant City Clerk